**Byzantine Liturgy**

October 5, 2015

### Gregory Collins, OSB

Gregory Collins was born in Belfast in 1960. He studied at Queen’s University Belfast, gaining a doctorate in Byzantine Studies in 1991. He made Solemn Profession at Glenstal Abbey in 1994. Following ordination as priest in 1995, he studied Depth Psychology at the Jung Institute in Zurich. Between 1998 and 2002 Father Gregory was Headmaster of Glenstal Abbey School, after which he spent six years teaching Orthodox Theology and the History of Theology at the Benedictine university of Sant’ Anselmo in Rome. Since returning to Glenstal, Father Gregory has had a varied ministry of writing and preaching retreats. Among his publications are The Glenstal Book of Icons (Dublin: Columba Press, 2002) and Meeting Christ in His Mysteries: A Benedictine Vision of the Spiritual Life (Dublin: Columba Press, 2011)

1. Introductions. We introduced ourselves.
2. Collins noticed that there are no Eastern Rite. He will explain the Eastern Churches. There are six or seven church traditions.
3. See Vladimir Lossky, *The Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church.* 1942. Translated from French to English later. “A superb book, but completely tendentious.”
4. “The” mystical theology? There’s only one? And what is “mystical” theology. Of “the” Eastern Church? What is “Eastern” Christianity? East of what?
5. “We’re all postmodern, whether we like it or not. Suspicion of “grand narratives.” Lossky’s book is a “grand narrative.” But he oversimplifies.
6. Who are the “Eastern” churches?
7. The world of Late Antiquity. It is the intervening period (3rd-7th century) between the classical and medieval periods. Note:
8. Christianity began in the Eastern Mediterranean, a culture marked by four great cities: Rome, Alexandria, Syrian Antioch, and Constantinople. Jerusalem was a minor suffragan diocese. Collins advises us to visit Caesarea Philippi.
9. The three centers: Rome, Antioch, Alexandria.

* Rome was associated with Peter and Paul. The oldest feast, June 29, is the feast of the two apostles. Peter was raised above Paul.
* Antioch was associated with Peter.
* Alexandria was associated with Mark.

1. Easter traditions are associated with Alexandria and Antioch. Constantine, a native of Illyria, was acclaimed as Emperor (AD 306-337) in Eboracum (modern York), and he moved the center of the Church to Byzantium, his new city on the Bosporus. It was raised to the status of an imperial capital, *Nea Romé*, and New Rome became the capital of the empire. German scholars spoke of Byzantium, but the local people called the people “Romans.”
2. The “Greeks” were “East Romans” or just Christians.
3. Byzantium or Constantinople has no connection with apostolicity. It invented the legend that the apostle Andrew founded it, and the Patriarch of Constantinople is linked to St. Andrew.
4. In the Old City of Jerusalem, there is the “other” upper room, in the Syrian section of the city. The Syrian Christian community takes pride in its upper room. Dormition abbey has a 13th century crusader room.
5. The Role of Jerusalem.
6. It was a minor outpost of the church of Caesarea, but it emerged into prominence in the fourth century.
7. Helena, the mother of Constantine, made a pilgrimage to Jerusalem (acc. to Eusebius). After Helen, mass tourism began. She found the sacred cross in the Holy Sepulchre. Contantine began to patronize the area. He built basilicas, but also created state interference and the birth of Christendom. He built the Holy Sepulchre (as a counterpart to the Temple Mount).
8. Justinian, in the sixth century, rebuilt the Holy Sepulchre. Justinian built Hagia Sophia in Constantinople over the ruins of a Constantinian site.
9. Syrian Influence.
10. In the past two years, there is the destruction of the Syrian church, one of the oldest Christian traditions. You can find its remains in Berlin.
11. Their theological traditions have been rediscovered. Google “Syrian spirituality.”
12. The Churches.
13. The Latin Church (Rome). England was evangelized by Rome, but Ireland was evangelized by missionaries. The term “Uniate” is offensive, but there are the “Eastern Catholics” who entered into union with Rome. [The establishment of the Anglican Ordinariate is destined for death, said Collins. Uniatism has no future.]

* Armenian Catholic Church.
* Chaldean Church. Numerically tiny.
* Coptic Catholic Church.
* Latin Church.
* Greek Catholic (Melkite) Church. They are the most independent of the Eastern Catholic Churches.
* Maronite Church. These are the Lebanese. They have always been in union with Rome.
* [West] Syrian Catholic Church. They are in communion with the Copts and with the Armenian Church. The Turks wiped out the Armenians in the genocide. At St. James’ Church (Armenian), there is prayer at 3:00. [Frans Bouwen had distinguished between the “Syrian Catholic Church” (which Collins called “West Syrian”) and the Syrian Orthodox Church (which Collins called “East Syrian”).]

Additions from Collins:

* Romanians. To the Orthodox, the Roman church “poached” the Eastern Church. The Eastern Catholic Romanian church, for example, entered into communion with Rome. Rome likes to think of this church as a “bridge to the East.” The Orthodox see its members as “poached.”
* Ukrainians.
* Malabar Christians in Kerala. Western historians were doubtful about St. Thomas, but now it is likely that St. Thomas may have visited India. There are also Keralan Jews. They were linked to the East Syrians. They sang the liturgy in Syriac, but inculturated with Hinduism. Then, in the 16th century, the Portuguese “Westernized” the church. Some Christians broke off from the Malabar Church, the Syro-Malanchars. They affiliated with the Eastern Syriac Church. And some Syro-Malanchars came back to unity with Rome. Typically, the Malabar Christians were not allowed by Rome to evangelize India.

1. Oriental Orthodox Church (non Chalcedonian or “monophysite”; perhaps “Miaphysite”). Rowan Williams: “For a Christian, there’s no better state to be in than dead.” Miaphysitism (sometimes called henophysitism) is a [Christological](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Christological) formula of the [Oriental Orthodox Churches](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Oriental_Orthodoxy). Miaphysitism holds that in the one person of [Jesus](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Jesus) [Christ](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Christ), Divinity and Humanity are united in one (μία, mia - "one" or "single") nature ("[physis](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Physis)"), the two being united without separation, without confusion, and without alteration.

* Coptic Orthodox Church. Headed by the Patriarch of Alexandria. It broke communion with the Greeks and Latins in the seventh century. Egypt used to be the liturgical language, but today it is Arabic. Egypt was 70% Christian until the 14th century, but this declined after the Islamization of Christianity. The Egyptian Church evangelized south to Ethiopia.
* Syrian Orthodox Church. There is an agreement between the Catholic Church and Western Syrian Church. One priest of one church can officiate at another’s church.
  + East Syrian. Part of the Syrian tradition (“Assyrian”) lost contact with the West in 431 and lost the ability to speak Greek. The church evangelized as far as China in the 13th century. There were East Syrian monasteries throughout the Silk Road, but they were wiped out by Genghis Khan and Tamerlaine. Today they exist in Iraq. Syrian is an offshoot of Aramaic.
  + West Syrians. They are in communion with the Copts and with the Armenian Church. The Turks wiped out the Armenians in the genocide. At St. James’ Church (Armenian), there is prayer at 3:00.
* (Ethiopian Orthodox Church). It was founded by Egyptian Christianity, and it got its independence in the 1950s. The Ethiopian Church is a mixture of Judaism and Coptic Christianity. They have circumcision. There is a “new Jerusalem” in Ethiopia.
* Armenian Orthodox Church. It accepted Christianity before the Roman emperor. It has good relationships with the Anglicans. Its members are in communion with the Copts and the West Syrians, but not the East Syrians. The Armenians were once called “monophysite,” but they call themselves “Oriental Orthodox” (Armenians, Copts, and West Syrians). We don’t call the Greek Orthodox “schismatics” any more. [John Henry Newman was called “the pastor” of St. Mary’s Church in Oxford, but he wasn’t a pastor. He was the “priest,” not the “pastor.”]

1. Eastern Orthodox Church (Byzantine – Chalcedonian). It is a family of churches defined by the Mediterranean. Just as Rome evangelized into Spain, England, and northern Europe, so the Byzantines ran their missions up through the Balkans. Cyril and Methodius invented the Slavonic alphabet. The books were brought north, and led to the evangelization of Russia. The Greeks and Russians speak to the Latin Catholics, but not to one another. Although they’re all Orthodox, the cultural differences are immense. Russia terrifies Greeks. “In the Orthodox world, Russia is looked at with trepidation.”

* Greek Orthodox Patriarch of Alexandria.
* Greek Orthodox Patriarchate of Antioch.
* Greek Orthodox Patriarchate of Jerusalem.
* Orthodox Church of Cyprus.

Coffee Break

1. Orthodox Church. Its Liturgical Tradition.
2. Elements: Politics and Geography.
3. Hagia Sophia is a museum, not a mosque.
4. Patriarch and Emperor were close in Constantinople.
5. Byzantine and the Cult of the City of Constantinople.
6. The focus is on the Patriarch’s Cathedral: Hagia Sophia.
7. Regular Orthodox liturgies reflect what took place in Hagia Sophia before 1542.
8. The Typical Byzantine Church.
9. Features of a Basilica

* Narthex or atrium.
* The ideal image of a basilica is the church of Narwan.
* Apse facing the East.
* Clerestory windows.

1. Christian Churches differed from pagan shrines.

* Transepts added.
* Dome over the cross.
* To this day, you can see St. John the Baptist in the Christian Quarter of the Old City.

1. Architecture and Liturgy.
2. Elements.
3. The nave is overshadowed by the dome, which is the heaven of heavens.
4. The sanctuary has three apses:

* The Altar (or place of sacrifice, that includes the “holy table”)
* The Diakonicon.
* The Prothesis.

1. The Screen. Icons or tapestries are hung between the columns. The “solid wall of icons” is recent. The original iconostasis was made of columns with icons or tapestries between the columns.
2. In Orthodox Churches, the table of sacrifice was behind the iconostasis. An Orthodox Christian does not want to see the altar, because it is too holy. The Royal Doors are open between Easter and Pentecost. There is a “sacral atmosphere,” but also a “sacral apartheid,” separating priests from others.
3. The Melchite Church has a frescoed dome by Romanian artists.
4. The Dome with the Pantocrator.
5. For Byzantines, the Pantocrator was not oppressive, but looking down from heaven, blessing the world.
6. The dome was taken over in Islamic architecture, but there is no Christ. In Islam, there can be no incarnation of God.
7. God does not remain in the dome, for there is a kenosis, through the apse mosaic, typically “Our Lady of the Sign,” Mary praying with the Christ child. This is right above the holy table. There is a link between the transcendent Christ of the dome and the “present” Christ in the Eucharist. There is, in the church, a “moving icon,” the movement from the dome to the holy table.
8. Eschatological Thrust.
9. Christ is coming in the Eucharist.
10. Sometimes there is an “empty dome,” signifying the church waiting for Christi to return in glory.
11. The Eucharist is impossible without incarnation.
12. The Frescoes around the wall: The twelve feasts, and the Apostles, and the lesser hierarchy of saints.
13. In the light of candles, there is a “cloud of witnesses,” the church’s saints.
14. The building is a microcosm of the universe. Heaven comes down toward us. The earth is populated by the saints. The saint is not “in” the icon. The icon is one thing, the saint is the “prototype,” but there is a mystical dimension to the presence of the prototype in the icon.
15. The Liturgy Itself.
16. The core elements.
17. Preparation. Visitors hear a murmuring behind the screen, the Proskomidé. Then the doors are opened. The priest and deacon go from the holy table to the front of the iconostasis. That was the original beginning of the liturgy. In ancient times, the emperor and the patriarch entered from the back. The entrance of the priest and deacon is called the “little entrance,” symbolizing the entry of Christ from mystery into the world of the liturgy.
18. Liturgy of the Word. On a normal Sunday Mass, there are no OT readings; they are reserved for big feasts. The “great entrance” is the transfer of the bread and wine from the prothesis to the sanctuary. At the great entrance, the people are to venerate the elements, but not to prostrate themselves. The elements are carried forward: Jesus is marching to his passion.
19. Transfer of the gifts to the table. The Latins prepare the gifts differently from the Orthodox. In our tradition, the sacristan puts out the bread and the wine on a side table without ceremony. This changed at Vatican II. In the Orthodox tradition, there is leavened bread, which is treated during the rite of preparation (Proskomidé). The particles are divided into the Mother of God and the saints. They are arranged on a paten, covered with a star and a veil. With a lance, the priest pierces the bread through the veil. He recapitulates salvation history: the star at Jesus’ birth, and his wound at the time of death. This preliminary consecration is an icon of the Eucharist.
20. Blessing prayer and Communion. The particles of consecrated bread are dropped into the wine, and distributed through a spoon. “Eucharist soup” is transferred by a spoon, the “medicine of immortality,” making it easy for bearded men. People go to communion infrequently. In the Russian tradition, you must have sacramental confession before reception of the Eucharist. All the children are brought to communion, but no one else goes. Christians are “communicated” from childhood, but they stop when they reach the age of reason.
21. Conclusion. The priest says a prayer before the icon. At the end of the liturgy, the people kiss the cross and the priest’s hand. The priest gives them a piece of blest bread, called “instead of the gift” (*antidoron*, ordinary leavened bread which is blessed but not consecrated) of the Eucharist.
22. Cultural Adaptation.
23. Rome is famous for sobriety and simplicity. But the Byzantine liturgy has many repetitions. *Kyrie eleison* is repeated hundreds of times. The repetitions create the impression of “unceasing prayer.”
24. The liturgy is perpetual prayer, perpetual intercession, repeated litanies. Every human need is expressed.
25. Inculturation. The Arab clergy cannot become bishops in the Greek Orthodox Church. Thus the Latin Church is much more inculturated than the Greek Church.
26. Use of Incense. It hearks back to the Jerusalem Temple, but also to the Book of Revelation (which is never read in the Orthodox liturgy). The Rublev icon (the visitation of Abraham) was cleaned in the early twentieth century. It had been obscured by smoke. Latin Catholics emphasize analysis and dialogue. Orthodox Christians are more mystical, contemplative.
27. Initiation. Rites for adults have been adapted for children. The baptismal candidate is stripped, turned to the West and invited to spit on the Satan. Then the candidate is turned to the East. The child is immersed. Read the *Didache*. It reflects the Eastern Baptism. The Greeks don’t separate Baptism from Confirmation. They “chrismate” the child, who is then given communion. The separate sacrament of Confirmation is a Western innovation.

Lunch

1. Bibliography. Collins distributes two handouts:
2. “Bibliography for Course on Greek Orthodoxy.” Collins emphasizes Jaroslav Pelikan, Vladimir Lossky, and S. Bulgakov. When the Nazis came to Bulgakov in Paris, they demanded if there were any Jews in his house. Bulgakov held up his pectoral cross and said, “Have you ever heard of this Jew?”
3. “Identifying the Eastern Churches.” This is the morning’s handout.
4. Theology of Orthodoxy. Bulgakov’s school of Sophiology.
5. Two Trends.
6. Vladimir Lossky (Neo-Patristic trend) belonged to the Moscow Patriarchate in Paris.
7. Sergius Bulgakov (Sophiology).
8. He belonged in Paris to the Constantinople Patriarchate. He viewed the Moscow Patriarchate as Bolshevik.
9. He was located at St. Sergius in Paris (connected to St. Vladimir’s Seminary in New York).
10. Sophiology.
11. Question: would the Orthodox Church focus on Slavic Orthodoxy or on Western Europe? Bulgakov’s group, influenced by Soloviev (+1899), believed that the future was to open up to the West.
    1. They entered into dialogue with German Idealism (like Karl Rahner).
    2. It was a movement of regeneration of Orthodox via dialogue with the world, but it was condemned by Bolshevism.
12. Sophiologists embraced what they called Sophia or Sapientia.
    1. Based on the Book of Wisdom (deutero-Canonical).
    2. The wisdom of God delights to be in the world, and the big question was not about God, but about the relation of God to the created world.
    3. Sophiologists criticized traditional Orthodoxy for its opposition to the world. It came from dialogue with Hegel and Schelling. Conservatives in the Orthodox world condemned it.
13. Wisdom.
    1. Bulgakov was condemned for bringing a “fourth person” into the Trinity, i.e., Sophia, in 1935.
    2. Bulgakov’s friend, the Patriarch of Paris, would not implement the condemnation.
    3. Bulgakov died in 1944. The condemnation has hung over his head. He was never condemned for heresy.
14. The Return of Bulgakov in Post-Soviet Russia. Ten years ago, his works were published. They are available in Russia:
    1. His major works:

* *The Lamb of God*. Christology.
* *The Comforter*. On the Paraclete.
* *The Bride of the La*mb. Ecclesiology and Eschatology.

1. Christology or Kenosis Theology (Philippians 2).
   1. The phrase “He emptied himself” is important. Kenosis means, “Jesus threw himself out from heaven,” and took the form of a slave. This is a major text in Orthodox theology.
   2. For Bulgakov, it was a way to unlock the mystery of the Trinity. The incarnation is the sign on earth of a process in God, the self-emptying of God. God the Father gives himself. For Bulgakov, this was revealed to teach us what God is like, i.e., to reveal the kenotic life of the Trinity. Moltmann was influenced by this, as was von Balthasar.
   3. The Trinity is a circle of self-giving love. We’re called to be self-giving love. *God with Us*, by Catherine Mowry Lacugna. The self-giving love is supposed to be the Church. The Russian Church has many examples of this: passionate kenotic love. [Balthasar, who was influenced by Bulgakov, and so who understood the crucifixion as an experience of self-giving love, still held to a traditional soteriology of vicariousness (Jesus suffered for us), of compensation (he paid the price for us sins), and of retribution (Jesus “became sin” and his death was God’s punishment of sin).]
2. Pneumatology in *The Comforter*.
   1. The Holy Spirit does not present herself, but is behind the scenes in the drama. For Bulgakov, there is a hidden creative spirit in history. It’s like Hegel’s “cunning of history.”
   2. The *shekinah* or luminosity of God is the faceless, moving presence of the Spirit in Jesus.
   3. St. Augustine taught him that the Holy Spirit is the bond of love between the Father and the Son, the joy between the two divine persons.
3. Ecclesiology in *The Bride of the Lamb*.
   1. The church is not an institution, but is the mystical presence of Christ, the body of Christ.
   2. Bulgakov insisted there was universal salvation. But there are people who will eternally say “no” to God.
   3. Balthasar is not always honest about his debt to Bulgakov. John Paul II was a fan of Balthasar. For the generation of World War II, they saw the goodness of God shining through evil.
   4. Did Bulgakov claim to see further than the Holy Spirit? Was his teaching a novelty? Did he err in teaching universal salvation? Was he open to other religions? That is what his enemies said. But for Collins, Bulgakov’s teaching paved the way for modern theology. “Vatican II is unthinkable without these Russian theologians.”
4. Bulgakov visited a *Starets* (see Woody Allen’s *Love and Death*). A monk told him to go to communion. So he went to confession and communed. His son died and he became a Christian. Bulgakov saw “The Sistine Madonna” in Dresden. Two angels are drawing back a curtain. He experienced the protective presence of God.
5. Theology of Orthodoxy. Lossky’s school of Neo-Patristic Teaching.
   * 1. Definition.
6. Lossky did a lot of research of the Greek Fathers, and found a lot of strands of thought that mirrored modern Philosophy, especially French existentialism.
7. Apophatic Theology: away from language, negative theology. The sixth-century Syrian monk who called himself Pseudo-Dionysius the Areopagite.
   1. There is the affirmative way: the world manifests God’s creative purpose. (This is the way of Greek philosophy, and a recollection of metaphysics. The mind corresponds to reality: there is a correspondence between our mind and the world. By contemplating the things of this world, we gain insight into the world beyond the physical). God illuminates, cools and warms, and expresses himself through human language.
   2. Then there is the negative way: There is the way of negating human capabilities, negating the reliance on language. For example, the question of justice. It means more than retribution. Jesus taught that justice is God’s mercy. Justice is not merely God’s retribution. John of the Cross said that Christ freed the world when he was powerless. So “power” cannot be considered in purely human ways. Negative theology is about “deconstructing our conceptual cathedrals.”
8. Lossky’s Theology. One can learn how to affirm God, but that might lead us to atheism. In Christian mysticism, it’s not about being left with nothing. It’s about a leap into an experience.
9. We are not to play linguistic games, but we must recognize that we cannot control God. Lossky: “Out of the darkness, the darkness becomes the light” (see T. S. Eliot).
10. It’s not just an emptiness. It’s the experience of God as the other. God is not controllable.
11. Lossky wrote on Meister Eckhart under Etienne Gilson. He created a mystical theology. When you’re in the dark, light fails. “By love, God may be got and held; but by understanding never.”
12. Gregory of Nyssa said, “In the dark, the mind fails. New forms of perception – spiritual senses – emerge.” The
13. Liturgy. Lossky saw that the liturgy is the cultivation in prayer of a sensibility of the divine presence. That’s where academic theology has to stop. Only a spiritual director can deal with it. Evagrius said: “If you are a theologian, you will pray – for a theologian is a person of prayer.”
14. In the Orthodox Church, you cannot be a theologian and an atheist.
15. The spiritual sensation was expressed by Basil Hume: “When one is in the pitch dark with a lover, sight fails, and language becomes hard to handle.”

Coffee Break

1. Discussion.
   * + 1. John Zizioulas. Still living. A layman who advocated a communion theology. The whole church is manifested in the Eucharist. He wrote a dissertation on Ignatius of Antioch emphasizing the mystical dimension. “The Church makes the Eucharist, but the Eucharist makes the Church.”
2. The diocese is the “little church,” gathered around the bishop. Paul L. D. Avis and Rowan Williams argue for an Anglican theology of the church.
3. Zizioulis has been criticized. If the church is a worldwide communion of communities, parishes into dioceses, dioceses into nations, he asks, “Might the Orthodox be gathered around a *primus*, known as the Bishop of Rome?” The idea is that the Orthodox might eventually move toward Rome from below, and not have it imposed from above. Zizioulas, who emphasized the importance of the unity between the bishop and diocese, accepted a titular diocese.
4. The person is constituted by relationships. Why should Zizioulas (a Greek) be allowed to speculate on the inner life of the Trinity, and deny that to Bulgakov (a Russian). Zizioulas spoke in Dublin. Collins asked, “Do you have room for Teresa of Avila and John of the Cross?” He said, “I liked the style of your question, but I don’t like the content.”
   * + 1. Greek Metaphysics.
5. Lossky’s affirmative theology. This is the way of Greek philosophy, and calls metaphysics to mind. The mind corresponds to reality: there is a correspondence between our mind and the world. By contemplating the things of this world, we gain insight into the world beyond the physical.
6. The intellect, said Lossky, has to pass through the fire of cross and resurrection.
7. Harnack: The simple gospel had been turned into something complicated by Hellenism. Harnack, said Collins, was over-simplifying.
8. Bulgakov’s way. Balthasar, who was influenced by Bulgakov, and so who understood the crucifixion as an experience of self-giving love, still held to a traditional soteriology of vicariousness (Jesus suffered for us), of compensation (he paid the price for us sins), and of retribution (Jesus “became sin” and his death was God’s punishment of sin).]
9. The Greek Orthodox.
10. Introduction. The Greeks would say, “We make the sign of the cross backward.” That is an example of ritual differences. What affects people is not rarified theology, but the practical matters: what people do.
11. Examples.
    1. Sign of the cross.
    2. Beardedness of men.
    3. Bread for the Eucharist.
    4. Chalice. The Greeks administer Communion with a spoon. “Liturgical craziness took the chalice from the people, and Vatican II restored it.” In the German church, drinking from the chalice is not normal.
12. Encounters.
    1. When people met each other (during the Crusades), there were differences.
    2. The Greeks thought the Latins were Judaizers, because they used unleavened bread; the Latins thought that the Greeks were schismatic.
13. Celibacy.
14. The Tridentine decrees imposed the monastic discipline of celibacy. Historically, it took a long time for the Latin Church to accept celibacy.
15. In the Byzantine Tradition, the bishops had to be monks. Only a monk can become a bishop. Are the bishops more dedicated? In reality, people take monastic vows as a career track.
16. “A bishop should be married to one woman,” according to 1 Peter – which goes against the celibacy prohibition.
17. Greek Religious Life.
18. It is basically monks, but St. Francis of Assisi broke the mold by moving out of the cloistered stable life. The Orthodox do not have a Francis of Assisi.
19. Styles of monastic life. In the 11th century, the monasteries ran hospitals. In Russia, they ran orphanages. But today there are few apostolic orders. The orthodox do not understand the Jesuits (apostolic life without monastic life).
20. The Holy Spirit.
21. The Roman Catholic *epiclesis* does not mention the Holy Spirit. We ask *God* to change the gifts. “There’s something missing,” says Collins. But he doesn’t mean that there’s something missing in the Eucharist. We’re not saved by the Holy Spirit, we’re saved by the spirit of Jesus.
22. The original *epiclesis* of the Roman Liturgy prays that an angel may carry the sacrifice up to heaven. The Greeks in the fourth century inserted a specific mention of the Holy Spirit after the consecration.
23. At the end of the Middle Ages, the Latins said that the words of institution “consecrate.” Zizioulas solved the problem. He said that we have the “institution” of the Eucharist (in the formula of institution) and the “constitution” of the Eucharist (by the power of the Holy Spirit).
24. The Filioque.
    * 1. Orthodox heard the creed being sung in Jerusalem with the words, “who proceeds from the Father.” This was the text of Constantinople (AD 381). But in Western Europe, the phrase “and the Son” was added.
25. The monks wrote to the Pope: “We keep the original text.” But when the German emperor was crowned in St. Peter’s, he insisted on the filioque. And Rome claims to have the primacy.
26. The monks felt that the Westerners had tampered with the creed. Does the Pope of Rome have the power to change? Not in the East. The Byzantine position was: “If you fail in orthodoxy, you cease to be successor of Peter.” He is *primus inter pares*. The Greeks said, his faith must be apostolic.
    * 1. Two Views of Polity.
27. The Church of Rome had the primacy. The West had a pyramidal model. It has led to a highly-efficient and well-organized Catholic Church. You can always appeal above your bishop. There is a tier of authority.
28. There is also a centralization, a hegemony, a domination of local bishops. Rome lost the Greek idea of a communion of communions. The danger is schism. “Rome has too much primacy and the Orthodox doesn’t have enough.” The “final say” for the Orthodox lies between Moscow and Constantinople.
    * 1. Consequence.
         1. Vatican II introduced the problem of the power of Rome v. the local church.
         2. The pope is presenting “communion theology.” The conservatives want papal authority. Rowan Williams feels powerless, because he has no authority.
      2. Other Issues.
         1. Marian Devotion. No Immaculate Conception or Assumption of Mary. Pius XII hadn’t consulted the Eastern Christians, above all, he hadn’t consulted the Orthodox Church in Constantinople. Current popes won’t define dogmas. The Orthodox believe that the Marian dogmas belong to the inner life of the Church, not to the forefront of evangelization.
         2. Protestant Reformation. The Reformation had no immediate influence on Orthodoxy. But eventually, there was the new militancy of the Counter Reformation Church. With their missionary spirit, Catholic Orders tried to bring Eastern Churches within the Latin ambit.
            1. The Tübingen theologians consulted the Eastern Churches, about “throwing off the yoke of Roman imperialism,” and the Eastern congratulated them, and urged them to come back to Orthodoxy.
            2. The Neo-Patristic movement of Lossky rejected Western neo-Scholastic theology. The Anglicans sought a pedigree, and studied at Oxford and Cambridge, but the answer is this: “Pray for the dead, venerate the saints, and . . . this is the earliest tradition.” The ordination of women is a sticking point. The Orthodox Church has to learn, said Collins, that it can’t control other churches.